

Center for Preservation Trades at Cazenovia
&
Shared-Use Campus
Preliminary Feasibility Study

Proposed by: Board of Directors, Cazenovia Heritage, Inc.
Report Prepared by: Anne B. Ferguson

March 31, 2023

1.0.0 MANAGEMENT SUMMARY

This project proposes that selected facilities of the Cazenovia College be considered for re-purposing as a Center for Preservation Trades. Of the three options examined to deliver this capability, a non-degree program by affiliation with a related private or public organization is deemed most feasible within the assumed time constraints.

On-site evaluation of potential facilities was not possible, therefore no specific Cazenovia College buildings are proposed, and it is possible the Center is not feasible for any of the existing facilities. Requirements of potential facilities nonetheless have been identified.

One community goal stated at the announced closing was to find a use that would retain much of the campus as a whole. As a result of this project, however, it is recommended that the campus serve multiple purposes, optimally of an educational or public nature. Development of a master site plan is strongly recommended to indicate desired use of existing facilities and spaces. This master plan is intended to guide real estate brokers and developers in creating proposals consistent with community character and desires.

The Cazenovia Heritage organization was asked to explore the concept of a preservation trades school and prepare this report. This is not to suggest that this is the only concept that Cazenovia Heritage would support for the campus; Cazenovia Heritage's objective is to ensure that buildings having architectural and historic significance are protected in considering how best to re-purpose the campus.

2.0.0 PROJECT PURPOSE AND CURRENT PHASE SCOPE

This project would establish a school or organization utilizing the existing facilities and resources of Cazenovia College to train people with the skills that support the restoration and preservation of historic architecture and cultural resources.

This phase is considered a preliminary feasibility phase, given that various cost factors are not available to undertake a full cost/benefits analysis. It nonetheless included the identification of opportunity and need; potential courses and programs; alternate delivery models; requirements of operations; requirements of potential facilities; and identification of cost categories and magnitude.

In addition to data gathering from public sources, input was received from BOCES Onondaga-Cortland-Madison (Colleen Vigiano, Deputy Superintendent); Onondaga Community College (Anastasia Urtz, Senior Vice Provost); Lorenzo State Park (Michael Roets, Regional Manager); Remlap Construction (Michael Palmer, President); Preservation Association of Central New York

(Andy Roblee, President); and representatives of the Northeast Regional Initiative for Preservation Trades.

2.1.0 ASSUMPTIONS & CONSTRAINTS

The following were taken into consideration in considering the requirements of the project:

- The school would need to be operational within two-five years.
- No data on current operating costs of buildings was available to the team. Therefore, no cost/benefits analysis is possible in this phase. As a result, no assumptions are made as to when such a school would be required to be net revenue positive.
- Inspection of potential buildings is not possible until after 2023 graduation.
- The school could be operated by an educational institution, a business, public agency, or non-profit organization.

“Preservation Trades” is defined as skilled jobs requiring training and knowledge specific to the maintenance, restoration, and rehabilitation of historic buildings, places, and objects (i.e., at least 50 years old).

3.0.0 BACKGROUND

3.1.0 PRESERVATION TRADES AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT

3.1.1 NEED

There is a critical shortage of workers skilled in the rehabilitation of older buildings, both across the country and in Central New York. The shortage is particularly acute in the specialized trades that are needed for historic preservation projects, such as masonry, window restoration, plaster repair, and finish carpentry. Yet the shortage also is becoming apparent in local revitalization efforts and in the push to retrofit and weatherize older buildings to combat climate change -- efforts now funded within the Inflation Reduction Act of 2022. The lack of available skills has become visible in the aftermath of natural disasters when communities look to repair and rebuild historic structures. And, the State Historic Preservation Office reports that the Federal and New York State Rehabilitation Tax Credits have proven highly popular and are providing incentives for preservation, further increasing the demand for skilled workers.

New construction techniques and materials can differ greatly from historic construction. Tradespeople trained in modern construction do not necessarily have the skills and knowledge required to work on rehabilitation projects involving historic structures. The reasons for this shortage are numerous and diverse, and will not be reviewed here. Facts underscoring the unaddressed need, however, can be highlighted. A recently published (November 2022) nation-

wide, landmark analysis commissioned by the Preservation Maryland organization and the National Parks Service (the “Labor Study”) reveals¹:

- “On a national basis, 13.4 % of all building rehabilitation expenditures goes to historic buildings.
- 60% of jobs on historic rehabilitation projects need historic preservation-specific skills.
- 100,000 highly specialized trades workers will be needed over the next decade.”

Similarly, a report published March 2023 examined the need in four states in the Northeast (Maine, New Hampshire, Vermont, and New York) and concluded that all preservation trades in the region are experiencing moderate to severe workforce shortages, particularly in plastering, masonry, and carpentry.²

3.1.2 OPPORTUNITY

While the above are national observations, they undoubtedly translate to New York communities. The population of historic buildings and structures in upstate New York is significant. Over 175 communities in New York State alone have historic preservation districts and/or demolition review processes providing protections against destruction of historic buildings or incompatible changes to architecture and other cultural resources. A probably equal or greater number of historic buildings exist individually in surrounding Towns. Over time, many will have maintenance or restoration needs requiring preservation skills. The Labor Study projects 13.3 million buildings will reach the 50-year mark over the next decade and notes the following additional key findings:³

- “By 2030, the total number of buildings that could be considered “historic” will grow by an [additional] 5.7 and 8.3 million.
- The total investment in historic buildings, including through the Federal Tax Credits program, is estimated to be nearly \$37 Billion -- \$12 Billion in Residential property and \$25 Billion in Non-residential buildings.
- Historic rehabilitation activity is expected to create close to 166,000 direct jobs annually.
- The rehabilitation of historic buildings is a labor-intensive activity, meaning a high share of the total cost goes to labor. These projects create more localized jobs compared to new construction activity.

¹ PlaceEconomics for The Campaign for Historic Trades, *Status of Historic Trades in America*, 2022, pages 3, 14; accessed via <https://historictrades.org/laborstudy/> 21 Mar 2021. This referenced study is believed to be the most comprehensive survey ever done on the status of the preservation/heritage trades in the United States.

² Northeast Regional Initiative for the Preservation Trades, *Understanding and Advancing the Preservation Trades*, page 5; accessed via <https://extension.unh.edu/resource/research-report> 28 Mar 2023

³ PlaceEconomics for The Campaign for Historic Trades, *Status of Historic Trades in America*, 2022, pages 2, 3 and homepage; accessed via <https://historictrades.org/laborstudy/> 21 Mar 2021

- For every ten direct jobs created by rehabilitating a historic building, another 1.8 to 2.4 additional jobs are created elsewhere in the economy.
- \$11.3 Billion direct labor income is created by historic rehabilitation activity.
- On average, for every \$100 in direct labor income, an additional \$186 is generated in paychecks for indirect and induced jobs.”

There has been particular recent emphasis by preservation grant providers on underserved communities, particularly in urban areas. Such neighborhoods typically have historic, though possibly neglected, buildings. This presents an opportunity to provide training to potential tradespeople and job-seekers in those areas, as well as to encourage community revitalization. Additionally, preservation trades historically have been represented predominantly by white men. While more women have entered the field in recent years, the demand for skills presents an opportunity to increase both gender and racial diversity within the preservation field.

Within the New York State proposed budget for 2023-2024, up to \$180.4 Million has been proposed to support new workforce development efforts, extending a \$350 Million workforce development initiative that began in the 2022-2023 Enacted Budget. This is in addition to a proposed \$100 Million for the *NY Forward Program* in support of equitable recovery of rural and smaller communities, and another \$225 Million for Regional Economic Development Council (REDC) awards.⁴ A school for preservation trades is consistent with the goals of these budgeted programs.

The closure of Cazenovia College provides an opportunity to convert facilities, equipment, and other assets to a school for preservation trades that would help to address this critical workforce need and increase regional economic growth.

3.2.0 OFFERINGS BY EXISTING INSTITUTIONS OR ORGANIZATIONS

There are no accredited schools specifically for the preservation trades within Central New York. Nationally, there are only about a dozen institutions that grant four or two-year degrees in Preservation Arts programs, such as American College of the Building Arts (Charleston SC), Savannah Technical College (Savannah GA), or North Bennet Street School (Boston MA).

Some institutions offer “certificate” one-year programs. SUNY-Westchester Community College is the only community college in the state of New York to offer a certificate program in Historic Preservation. It is a one year, non-credit certificate program for students and professionals in the building trades, as well as in historic site management, artifact conservation, and more. Its 140 hours required are roughly split equally between classroom and field work.⁵

⁴ NYS Preliminary 2023-2024 Budget numbers provided by Al Stirpe, Assemblyman for NY District 127, 02 Mar 2023

⁵ SUNY Westchester-Peekskill; accessed via <https://www.sunywcc.edu/> 29 Mar 2023

Other organizations offer three to five-day workshops on specific topics, such as Historic Eastfield Foundation (East Nassau NY); still others have one to three-day workshops for homeowners, and “volunteer-ism” learning experiences for tourists/travelers.

The National Park Service has several training programs, often on-site at historic buildings. It awards grants (\$15-\$20,000) to fund specialized workshops to identify and address technical preservation needs. It also operates a school at Frederick, Maryland with courses on preservation and related design and construction fields. The National Trust for Historic Preservation offers the HOPE Crew, training young adults in preservation crafts on historic resources on public lands. Similarly, organizations in various states work on projects on public lands.

Other programs are geared to recruiting urban dwellers to become apprentices in learning restoration and rehabilitation skills to be applied within their communities, such as the Living Trades Academy in Detroit, Michigan. Still other organizations provide workshops in traditional or “historic crafts,” such as rush seat weaving, hearth cooking, and the like.

Traditional trades -- defined loosely here to mean Carpentry, Electrical Work, and Plumbing -- are offered through most community colleges in Central New York, including Onondaga Community College, Cayuga Community College, Tompkins-Cortland Community College, and SUNY-Morrisville.

In brief, at the national, regional, and state levels, preservation training is highly decentralized, of an inconsistent curriculum, and assumes a somewhat gun-shot approach.

4.0.0 EVALUATION OF ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES

Three options surfaced for establishing a Preservation Trades School:

- An independent two-year, degree-granting school
- A certificate granting school run by an existing for-profit or non-profit educational institution
- A program affiliated with an established organization, either public or private, related to historical and/or curatorial preservation, history, or preservation trades

Each was evaluated as to its:

- Technical feasibility (i.e., can it be created/built within the two-five-year time constraint); and,
- Operational feasibility (will it be sufficiently utilized so as to be sustainable).

Financial feasibility (i.e., will revenue meet a desired threshold against the start-up and on-going operational costs) was not examined due to unavailability of data, though a high level assessment was possible.

4.1.0 INDEPENDENT DEGREE-GRANTING SCHOOL

This option has considerable start-up requirements. Key aspects of technical and operational feasibility perspectives are summarized here:

- Because of the specialized offerings and intentionally small class size, enrollment would be insufficient to support maximum use of the existing campus infrastructure.
- To enable maximum use of Cazenovia College facilities, the scope was expanded to include Traditional Trades to increase enrollment. Most of the community colleges and BOCES offer one or more of the traditional trades (see Attachment I), issuing certificates, and also are undertaken with junior and senior high school students. Unions provide training centers for their apprenticeships. The Upstate NY Chapter of Masonry Contractors Association of America, which represents both union and open-shop masonry contractors, provides a certification program. It was concluded that including traditional trades would likely compete with existing institutions for the same students, rather than increasing the pool of potential students.
- It is likely that the majority of applicants to a degree granting school would be young adults rather than mid-career incumbents.
- If financial aid were to be provided, the school would require accreditation, with State approval of an Associate Degree curriculum, faculty, and the school's education plan.
- Attracting faculty and administrative staff, creating administrative processes, renovating facilities, wide-spread marketing, and recruitment of students would be required.
- Funding likely would need to be applied for and granted by the State and Federal governments and programs.
- Though not impossible, it does not appear feasible that an accredited school could be established within the desired timeframe for operation.

4.2.0 TRADES SCHOOL THROUGH AN EXISTING EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTION

In this option, a Preservation Trades School would be run by an existing for-profit or public non-profit educational institution.

The Village/Community group advised earlier this year that outreach had been made to non-profit educational institutions as to their interest in the college campus and had found no interest. However, this may have assumed use of the Cazenovia College for such colleges' existing degree offerings, as opposed to implementing and operating courses and non-degree programs of curriculum that they currently do not offer.

In a recent discussion with BOCES, a representative advised that expanding its curriculum is considered twice a year by its Advisory Council; as a first step, it is willing to raise at an upcoming meeting the option of offering Preservation Trades on-site at Cazenovia.

Providing a Trades School through an existing educational institution offers advantages over an independent school:

- Existing institutions are already accredited;
- Existing institutions have an established administrative infrastructure;
- The institution could leverage existing marketing and recruitment programs;
- The institution could integrate course offerings to broaden existing curriculums at universities;
- Has greater ability to recruit faculty;
- Allows funding to be provided by State and Federal programs;
- Allows overhead costs and insurance to be spread over a larger and existing base;
- Less costly than an independent school.

Similarly, a for-profit school would have the above advantages. One for-profit candidate identified was Universal Technical Institute (Phoenix AZ) which offers specialized hands-on training programs at facilities throughout the country.

A disadvantage of this option is that proposed courses could supplement existing degree programs only, without necessarily producing those willing to enter the trades. It also is doubtful that with the exception of the for-profit school, institutions would hold classes at Cazenovia. This approach would not utilize the entire campus facilities.

Should this option nonetheless be preferred, it is recommended that outreach efforts be re-initiated and expanded geographically to include Cornell University, Winterthur-University of Delaware, Syracuse University, Universal Technical Institute, and other universities having architecture and related programs to ascertain any interest.

4.3.0 NON-DEGREE PROGRAM BY AFFILIATION WITH RELATED ORGANIZATION

In this option, courses would be taught at Cazenovia College facilities but affiliated with an established non-profit or public organization whose mission is consistent with historical preservation of cultural resources, history, archival studies, or a related field.

This option could provide an educational component to an organization currently lacking facilities and resources, as well as broaden the geographical footprint of other organizations currently delivering programs. Such organizations could be within New York or out of state.

Several examples of potential affiliated organizations include:

- The Preservation Society of Newport County, RI (“Newport Mansions”)
- Winterthur, Wilmington DE (currently offers graduate programs in Material Culture and in Art Conservation)
- Colonial Williamsburg (Williamsburg VA)
- National Parks Service/NYS SHPO/Lorenzo State Park (Cazenovia NY)
- Cazenovia Public Library - Archival Resources (Cazenovia NY)

Factors in considering technical and operational feasibility:

- Minimal application review and acceptance process required; paying applicants could be accepted on “first come” basis.
- This could be offered as a certificate granting program or one offering Career and Technical Education (CTE) credits toward a certification and credentialing program.
- No financial aid would need to be offered, therefore no state accreditation required (recognizing certification requirements may need to be met, if offered)
- Programs could be divided into multiple levels, i.e., with pre-requisite courses required. This would allow for a formal, consistent curriculum to be established.
- Administration, insurance, etc. could be assumed by the affiliated organization.
- Allows leveraging of marketing efforts by the affiliated organization.
- Funding for programs could be available from sources available to the affiliated non-profit, such as REDC grants, NYS Preservation League, the National Trust for Historic Preservation, Donors, Friends’ groups – i.e., sources not available to public education institutions. If the affiliated organization is out-of-state, it may provide other funding opportunities not available to New York organizations.
- Given the smaller scale, this is likely the least costly option.

This option would require use of some, but not all, of the College facilities.

4.4.0 RECOMMENDED DELIVERY APPROACH

Offering courses through an affiliated organization is the most feasible for consideration. To distinguish it from a degree granting institution, the programs would be operated as a “Center for Preservation Trades.”

[Note: The Cazenovia Heritage organization has prepared this report but does not propose itself to be an affiliated organization.]

5.0.0 REQUIREMENTS OF A CENTER FOR PRESERVATION TRADES AT CAZENOVIA

5.1.0 OPERATING MODEL

The Center typically would provide 3-5 day courses, one to two courses at a time, initially ten times per year. Saturday classes over one or two months also could be considered, depending on the course content. The initial targeted audience would be incumbent mid-career tradespersons. The 3-5 day duration allows for those working to take time off from their jobs more easily than be absent for an entire semester. This audience is felt to have the necessary baseline skills, commitment, maturity, life skills, and desire for quality.

Classes or workshops in the field or on location can be considered; for example, at an urban restoration project in Syracuse, as well as at a historic rural home. Classes also could be supplemented by excursions to local museums, universities, or restoration shops.

As the Center matures, the frequency of classes could increase. Future course and curriculum development could target young adults entering the trades, along with creating mentoring programs. One-day programs open to homeowners and/or as part of public continuing education programs also could be considered.

Due to the need for close and individualized instruction, class size would optimally be 12-15 students per class.

5.2.0 POTENTIAL COURSE OFFERINGS

The following are identified as the desired and higher priority courses:

- Plaster Repair & Restoration
- Preservation Carpentry & Woodworking
- Specialty Millwork
- Preservation Masonry & Mortars
- Window Repair & Installation
- Window Glass Restoration
- Preservation Roofing
- Ornamental Ironwork Preservation
- Preservation Painting & Finishing
- Monument/Cemetery Restoration
- Metal Working, Ironwork, & Tin smithing
- Repair of Historic Lighting Fixtures
- Stabilization and Dismantling of Historic Buildings
- Preservation & Restoration of Traditional Decorative Arts (Selective) & Vintage Pottery
- Future: Timber framing, wallpaper restoration/reproduction*

*Courses for later consideration and/or which could require collaboration with other institutions include timber framing and wallpaper restoration and reproduction. For example, arrangements with SUNY-Morrisville could be pursued for undertaking timber framing classes within its 14,000 square foot construction classroom. Attachment II provides a comprehensive list of additional course needs identified by participants in the Labor Study, reflecting the broad scope nationally.

Workshops in traditional or “historic crafts,” are proposed for future consideration as they would not have the economic impact of preservation trades.

5.2.0 FACILITIES

Access to campus buildings to evaluate suitability is not possible until June. At that time, candidate buildings should be evaluated against requirements.

5.2.1 WORKROOM and CLASSROOM

As noted above, the Affiliated Institution option would require use of some, but not all, of the College facilities. Attachment III indicates the minimum square footage requirements, summarized below.

Due to the nature of the hands-on work, one large room of 24 ft x 24 ft or roughly 800 square feet minimum would accommodate the proposed classes. This space would require a ceiling height of at least 10 feet.

One traditionally sized classroom is desired, accommodating up to 25 students, 30 ft by 30 ft, and equipped with technology for presentations and lectures. Square footage is estimated at 900 square feet minimum.

Workroom & Classroom Sub-Total: 1700 sq ft

5.2.2 COMMON SPACES

In addition to classroom space, the Center would require space for common areas, at the following minimum square foot requirements:

- A common trades tool room/shop: 24 ft x 24 ft (600 square ft) to house equipment such as planers, sanders, table saw, etc.
- Indoor lumber storage: 14 ft x 30 ft (420 square feet)
- Storage room for materials: 14 ft x 20 ft (280 sq ft) to house masonry materials, finishes, etc.
- Supply Shop: 10 ft x 12 ft (120 sq ft)
- Common sitting/relaxation area: 15 ft x 15 ft (225 sq ft)
- Lunch room/vending machines: 15 ft x 15 ft (225 sq ft)
- One part-time administrator’s office with copier equipment: 10 ft x 12 ft (120 sq ft)

Center for Preservation Trades at Cazenovia
Preliminary Feasibility Study

- Space for appropriate admin storage, maintenance, and infrastructure 10 ft x 12 ft (120 sq ft)
- Two Bathrooms, each 12 x 12 (288 sq ft)

It is assumed that a reciprocal arrangement could be made with SUNY-Morrisville for use of its 14,000 square foot construction facility for a timber framing class. If that is not possible and demand for this class is projected as high, additional square footage would be required.

Common Spaces Sub-Total: 2398 sq ft

Total Training Square Footage Preliminary Estimate: 4098 sq ft

The above excludes any “buffer space” required, entrances, hallways, and the like.

Evaluation of existing facilities would need to consider structural feasibility of renovation to accommodate size of rooms and weight of equipment.

5.2.3 HOUSING

There is the option to house students within an existing residential home-dorm or require them to stay at a local hotel. While the latter would benefit the local hotels, it would add to the students’ total cost of attendance. It may be a competitive advantage to provide housing, in which case a property such as 15 Lincklean is tentatively recommended.

5.3.0 INSTRUCTORS

No permanent full-time instructors would be required; instructors would stay on site for the course duration only. Instructors may be available from the affiliated institution or could be recruited nationally/regionally from similar organizations.

5.4.0 ADMINISTRATION

While the bulk of the administration would be provided by the affiliated institution, a part-time, on-site staff person is projected as required.

6.0.0 POTENTIAL COSTS

In addition to purchase price, renovation of the existing facilities would be required, primarily to expand room size. Renovation of a home-dorm will be necessary to convert bedrooms to single occupancy.

Capital costs include the purchase of shared equipment, tools, technology, and furniture.

On-going operational costs would be for instructors’ fees, part-time administrative staff, utilities, and other operating expenses.

7.0.0 BENEFITS

The obvious benefit lies in workforce development, expanding the number of skilled professionals in preservation trades. Having the workforce and skills to undertake historic rehabilitation projects that otherwise may not have been considered is an immediate benefit to contractors.

The impact on individual and community incomes and economic stability is evident from the findings cited in the Labor Study and noted earlier:⁶

- “The rehabilitation of historic buildings is a labor-intensive activity, meaning a high share of the total cost goes to labor. **These projects create more localized jobs compared to new construction activity.**
- For every ten direct jobs created by rehabilitating a historic building, another **1.8 to 2.4 additional jobs are created elsewhere** in the economy.
- \$11.3 Billion **direct labor income** is created by historic rehabilitation activity.
- On average, **for every \$100 in direct labor income, an additional \$186 is generated** in paychecks for indirect and induced jobs.”

On an individual level, training can provide greater employment security and potentially higher income.

Non-quantified soft benefits cited by participants in the Labor Study include: Work quality is increased; fewer mistakes have to be re-done; completed work will last longer; client satisfaction is increased; and there is greater ease for property owners to find qualified contractors.⁷

These benefits would be accrued beyond the Central New York region; however, they would be felt strongly here due to the lack of any such training programs and the shortage of tradespersons. There would be indirect benefit to the local economy as participants would visit restaurants and shops. The rich inventory of architecture within Cazenovia and Central New York provides a living and observable “classroom” for participants.

To the Affiliated Organization, providing a Center for Preservation Trades at Cazenovia would leverage its own brand and expand its geographic footprint. It would enhance its ability to be

⁶ PlaceEconomics for The Campaign for Historic Trades, *Status of Historic Trades in America*, 2022, pages 2, 3 and homepage; accessed via <https://historictrades.org/laborstudy/> 21 Mar 2021

⁷ PlaceEconomics for The Campaign for Historic Trades, *Status of Historic Trades in America*, 2022, page 48, 52; accessed via <https://historictrades.org/laborstudy/> 21 Mar 2021

viewed as a premier organization in preservation arts and trades. Indirectly, having the Center may increase attendance at its primary location.

8.0.0 SHARED USE CAMPUS

In examining the feasibility of a Center for Preservation Trades, it became apparent that only part of the College's facilities would be required. As a result, it is recommended that the remaining campus assets be utilized for public purposes and other education-oriented services. This could be accomplished by selling the assets individually or in parcels, to one developer or multiple developers. A most important pre-requisite is that a comprehensive potential site plan should be developed to guide the sale and desired use of assets.

A Shared Use Campus would provide an opportunity for other occupants to share common facility needs, i.e., food service/cafeteria, reception and meeting spaces, etc., and minimize redundant expenses. Facilities could be converted into retail, commercial, medical, government, as well as educational purposes.

One example of how properties could be re-purposed is shown on the attached site plan.

It is anticipated that some facilities of lesser significance (e.g., Watts Admin building, dormitories) would be demolished to accommodate parking, as well as to create additional open landscaping, parks, and/or gardens.

The attached is but one example of designating potential shared use of the campus. The desired uses could be developed with public input so that a desired master site plan could be developed that has community consensus.

Attachments